

March 1, 2011

Dear UNCG community,

In recent conversations with faculty and administrative leaders, the Office of Research and Economic Development (ORED) was asked to develop materials in support of campus deliberations regarding the positioning of community engagement and community-engaged scholarship in the promotion and tenure guidelines currently being re-examined and refined. Although each discipline, department, School and College will articulate the meaning and significance of community engagement and community-engaged scholarship based on its individual paradigms, policies, and practices, these efforts can be supported by a literature base of core principles and definitions.

The purpose of the attached document is to inform this work by providing some suggested language that integrates UNCG conversations and policy with scholarly literature to address how community engagement may be achieved through the scholarly activities of research, creative activity, teaching, and service – and, **how it may be defined within unit- and department-level promotion and tenure evaluation guidelines**. In particular, **we address the question of what is community engagement, and how high quality community-engaged research, creative activity, teaching, and service are distinct from *community service* (also referred to as *outreach*)**. We hope the attached definitions provide a reference point for faculty determinations of how community-engaged faculty work can be conceptualized, evaluated, and rewarded.

In an effort to be precise and to honor the university's commitment to differentiate between *scholarship* from *research* activities, (i.e., “The promotion and tenure guidelines of the University rest on a definition of scholarship that can be applied to all aspects of University work...” (Section I.A)), **we intentionally do not use the term *community-engaged scholarship* as a synonym of *community-engaged research/creative activity***. Instead, we provide a definition of community-engaged scholarship that addresses all forms of academic work (research/creative activity, teaching, service). This definition adheres to key principles of community engagement (mutually reciprocal partnerships and public purpose) and scholarship (work that demonstrates a high level of discipline-related proficiency, is creative or original, is amendable to documentation, may be peer or constituent-reviewed, and has significant impact (University-wide Promotion and Tenure Guidelines, Sections I.A and II.C.4)). To be clear, work that is done in a *scholarly* way (i.e., poses questions and systematically investigates practices and/or outcomes) does not necessarily comprise *scholarship* (i.e., is presented publically for peer-review)(Hutchings and Schulman, 1999). In sum, scholarship involves learning through well-grounded faculty work and sharing that learning (in any of a variety of forms) so that others can critique and build on it. Community-engaged scholarship, whether in the form of research, creative activity, teaching, directed professional service, or service, adheres to these criteria. Therefore, community-engaged research/creative activity, community-engaged teaching, and community-engaged service may be enacted in a scholarly way, but may not comprise scholarship unless a product (which may include many forms as outlined in the UNCG university-wide promotion and tenure guidelines) is created and made available for peer-review. [Note: Directed professional service may also practice principles of community-engagement, but the UNCG University-wide Guidelines for Promotion and Tenure, currently, neither define nor refer to community-engaged directed professional activity. This may be addressed at a future date.]

The University has a long history with and values many forms of community involvement across local, regional, state, national, and global levels. Indeed, “service” has been UNCG’s motto since 1894. Community involvement, and particularly community engagement, is expected of UNCG faculty, staff, and students as outlined in the 2009-2014 Strategic Plan, the University-wide Promotion and Tenure Evaluation Guidelines, the UNCG Mission and Values Statement, and the General Education Curriculum Learning Goals. The 4.3

Strategic Planning Implementation Report for Community Engaged Scholarship details explicit plans to support faculty, students, staff, and community partners in community-engaged activities. In 2008, UNCG received the Community Engagement elective designation from the Carnegie Foundation in recognition of its curricular engagement, as well as outreach and partnerships. In his first visit to UNCG as the UNC President, Dr. Ross commended UNCG for recognizing faculty members' work with the greater community as it corresponds with goals set forth by UNC Tomorrow. Distinctions between community engagement and community service, as well as between community-engaged research/creative activity and teaching and other forms of research and teaching are important to consider in our campus conversations—particularly with regards to drafting language in departmental promotion and tenure evaluation guidelines—because the relationships, processes, timelines, products, and outcomes may vary greatly across these forms of community involvement.

This document was written by Drs. Emily Janke (Special Assistant for Community Engagement, ORED) and Patti Clayton (Visiting Scholar, ORED), with assistance from Dr. Patrick Lee Lucas (2010-2011 Service-Learning Faculty Fellow, OLSL, and Associate Professor, Interior Architecture), and Vice Chancellor Terri Shelton; it draws carefully on a range of local and national conversations regarding the meaning of community engagement, scholarship, and community-engaged scholarship. The terms and definitions presented here represent a distillation of conversations, documents, policies, and reports, including those referred to in the paragraph above, the 14 meetings held during the *2010 Building the University's Capacity for Community Engagement Speaker Series* (co-sponsored by the Provost's Office, OLSL, ORED, Faculty Senate, UTLC) which involved nearly 300 faculty, staff, administrators, students, and community partners, as well as meetings with faculty members and representatives of various units, offices, institutes, networks, advisory boards, and centers.

This document is *not* intended to replace deliberate and collaborative conversation among faculty colleagues. We strongly encourage each unit to craft language that honors the core principles of community engagement, while using terms and examples that best embody the disciplines represented. Additional resources on how to define and evaluate community engagement and different forms of community-engaged scholarship within a variety of disciplines are available at: <http://olsl.uncg.edu/cbr/promotionandtenure/>. If you or your department would like additional information or resources, we encourage you to contact Emily Janke (emjanke@uncg.edu) or Patrick Lee Lucas (plucas@uncg.edu), who have been asked to provide such support.

We expect to make additions to this document in the future, particularly as faculty members write and approve their units' promotion and tenure review criteria and guidelines. To facilitate communication across the UNCG community, we will continue to collaborate with offices and units to provide resources, as well as to add current examples of how community engagement is articulated within various units. Updates will be posted online at <http://communityengagement.uncg.edu>. We hope you will share the results of your discussions with us by e-mail (communityengagement@uncg.edu) for others to see and refer to in their own work.

Sincerely,

Emily and Terri

Emily M. Janke, Ph.D.
Special Assistant for Community Engagement
Office of Research and Economic Development

Terri L. Shelton, Ph.D.
Vice Chancellor for Research and Economic Development
Carol Jenkins Mattocks Distinguished Professor

Terms and Definitions:**Community Engagement (CE), Community-engaged Scholarship, Community-engaged Research/Creative Activity, Community-engaged Teaching, Community-engaged Service****Community Engagement**

Community engagement (sometimes also referred to as *civic engagement*) is the “collaboration (among) institutions of higher education and their larger communities (local, regional/state, national, global) for the mutually beneficial exchange of knowledge and resources in a context of partnership and reciprocity.”¹ In the context of university documents and policies regarding faculty work, community engagement refers to research/creative activities, teaching, and service activities that are collaboratively undertaken by faculty members with community partners, staff, and/or students through processes that exemplify reciprocal partnerships and public purposes. Similarly, students may practice community engagement either inside or outside of the classroom, with and without faculty and staff, individually, in groups (e.g., clubs, greek organizations) through programs (e.g., academic and co-curricular, living-learning communities), research, creative activities, and courses – when enacted collaboratively with community partners through processes that exemplify reciprocal partnerships and public purposes.

Through community engagement, community and university knowledge and resources are brought together in and out of the classroom, as well as on and off campus to “enrich scholarship, research, and creative activity; enhance curriculum, teaching and learning; prepare educated, engaged citizens; strengthen democratic values and civic responsibility; address critical societal issues; and contribute to the public good.”² The “community” in community engagement is not defined by sector, such as private or public, for-profit or nonprofit; rather, community is broadly defined to include individuals, groups, and organizations external to campus that use collaborative processes for the purpose of contributing to the public good.³ “Reciprocity” is the recognition, respect, and valuing of the knowledge, perspective, and resources that each partner contributes to the collaboration.⁴

Community engagement and community service (often referred to as “outreach”) are often confused and/or conflated because both approaches may occur in the community and/or include activities that involve or serve community entities. While the latter describes activities that are provided *to*, intended *for*, or done *in* communities, the former describes activities that are undertaken *with* community members in a context of reciprocal partnership. Rather than activity or place, the key distinction between community engagement and community service can be determined by the processes and purposes that each emphasizes, as further explicated below:⁵

-- continued on page 4 --

¹ Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching. (2011). Classification Description: Community Engagement Elective Classification. Retrieved February 17, 2011 from

http://classifications.carnegiefoundation.org/descriptions/community_engagement.php?key=1213.

² Office for Public Engagement at University of Minnesota. (2011). What is public engagement? Retrieved February 17, 2011 from <http://www.engagement.umn.edu/WhatsPublicEngagement.html>.

³ Driscoll, A., & Sandmann, L. (2011). *Evaluation Criteria for the Scholarship of Engagement*. Retrieved February 15, 2011 from http://www.scholarshipofengagement.org/evaluation/evaluation_criteria.html.

⁴ Saltmarsh, J., Hartley, M., & Clayton, P. (2009). *Democratic Engagement White Paper*. Boston, MA: New England Resource Center for Higher Education. Retrieved on February 26, 2011 from <http://futureofengagement.wordpress.com/>

⁵ Saltmarsh, J., Hartley, M., & Clayton, P. (2009).

-- continued from page 3 --

Distinctions between Community Engagement and Community Service:

- (1) *community engagement* requires collaborative, reciprocal processes that recognize, respect, and value the knowledge, perspective, and resources shared among partners, whereas *community service* may be provided in a uni-directional, often times “expert,” model in which university resources are extended to serve community individuals, groups, organizations and the public in general;⁶
- (2) *community engagement* intends to serve a public purpose, builds the capacity of each of the individuals, groups, and organizations involved to understand and collaboratively address issues of public concern, whereas *community service* activities may focus on the delivery of expertise, resources, and services to community individuals, groups, organizations, and the public in general.

It is important to recognize that the University values many forms of service – and not all faculty are required to integrate community engagement into their faculty work. Clarity between the various types simply allows for greater recognition of the duration of the commitment, the resources needed, the processes followed, and outcomes expected of each form of service.

--- ---

⁶ Examples of community service can be found in the UNCG University-wide Promotion and Tenure Guidelines in Section II.C.1.c. Retrieved on February 26, 2011 from <http://provost.uncg.edu/documents/personnel/Proposed%20Eval%20Guidelines%20Final.pdf>.

Community-engaged Scholarship

The term *community-engaged scholarship* (sometimes also referred to as the *scholarship of engagement*) refers to research/creative activities, teaching, and service undertaken by faculty members in collaboration with community members (and often students) and that embody the characteristics of *both community engagement* (i.e., reciprocal partnerships, public purposes) and *scholarship* (i.e., demonstrates current knowledge of the field/discipline, invites peer collaboration and review, is open to critique, is presented in a form that others can build on, involves inquiry).⁷ It is important to note that scholarship and research are not synonymous, as stated in the UNCG University-wide Promotion and Tenure Guidelines,⁸ and, therefore, should not be conflated. It is also important to note that not all community-engaged activities undertaken by faculty comprise scholarship. Definitions of *community engagement*, *reciprocity*, and *community* are provided in the section above [see section on *Community Engagement*].

Useful definitions of community-engaged scholarship include:

- “teaching, discovery, integration, application and engagement that involves the faculty member in a mutually beneficial partnership with the community and has the following characteristics: clear goals, adequate preparation, appropriate methods, significant results, effective presentation, reflective critique, rigor and peer-review.”⁹
- “the collaborative generation, refinement, conservation, and exchange of mutually beneficial and societally relevant knowledge that is generated in collaboration with, communicated to, and validated by peers in academe and the community.”¹⁰

Community-engaged scholarship is often contrasted with the scholarship of application: while the latter “assumes that knowledge is generated in the university or college and then applied to external contexts with knowledge flowing in one direction, out of the academy,” the former “requires going beyond the expert model that often gets in the way of constructive university-community collaboration... calls on faculty to move beyond ‘outreach,’ ... [and] emphasizes ... genuine collaboration: that the learning and teaching be multidirectional and the expertise shared.”¹¹

In accordance with traditional disciplinary expectations of faculty scholarship,¹² the rigor of community-engaged scholarship should be demonstrated through the use of methods that are appropriate to the goals, questions, and context of the work.¹³ Community-engaged scholarship involves community partners to identify appropriate areas of inquiry, design studies and/or creative activities, implement activities that contribute to shared learning and capacity building, and/or engage in other activities that bridge university/college and community contexts. It uses the information gathered, the actions taken, and the relationships established to bring about positive change within the community and the higher education

-- continued on page 6 --

⁷ Glassick, C., Huber, M., & Maeroff, G. (1997). *Scholarship Assessed: Evaluation of the Professoriate*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

⁸ “Scholarship is characterized by creative intellectual work based on a high level of professional expertise, the significance of which can be validated by peers and which enhances the fulfillment of the mission of the university. Scholarship is not considered to be synonymous with research, but can be demonstrated by activities in teaching, research and creative activity, service, and directed professional activity” (p. 1).

⁹ Campus Community Partnerships for Health. (2011). Community-Engaged Scholarship. Retrieved February 17, 2011 from <http://depts.washington.edu/ccph/scholarship.html>.

¹⁰ Driscoll, A., & Sandmann, L. (2011).

¹¹ O’Meara, K., & Rice, E. (2005). *Faculty Priorities Reconsidered: Rewarding Multiple Forms of Scholarship*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

¹² Glassick, C., Huber, M., & Maeroff, G. (1997).

¹³ Driscoll, A., & Sandmann, L. (2011).

-- continued from page 5 --

institution. Its products include, but are not limited to, publications, exhibitions, and programs,¹⁴ as well as partnerships, courses, grants, curricula, experiences, or understandings that simultaneously advance the mission and goals of the higher education institution(s) and of the community organization(s), or the public more generally.

Finally, is important to recognize the integration of faculty roles, particularly in community-engaged scholarship. Faculty who undertake community-engaged scholarship may simultaneously contribute to multiple institutional goals by conducting their academic roles in an integrated way, using their research to inform their teaching, their service and teaching as sources of ideas for their research, and their teaching as opportunities to connect student learning with community issues¹⁵ - any of which may be done in collaboration with communities. For example, faculty may bring their research into the classroom, involve students in cutting-edge research, integrate their research interests with community issues, and teach with and learn from community members.¹⁶ All faculty, not only those who practice community engagement, may benefit from a system that allows faculty to demonstrate overlapping activities and roles and to show how one contributes to another. Ultimately, “failure to account for the ways and the extent to which faculty jointly produce teaching and service, research and teaching, or service and research may underestimate faculty contributions to institutional productivity.”¹⁷

It is important to recognize that the University values many forms of scholarship – and not all faculty are required to integrate community engagement into their faculty work. Clarity between the various types simply allows for greater recognition of the duration of the commitment, the resources needed, the processes followed, and outcomes expected of each form of scholarship.

--- ---

Community-engaged Research/Creative Activity

Community-engaged research and creative activity is the collaborative generation, refinement, conservation, and exchange of reciprocally beneficial and societally relevant knowledge that is generated in collaboration with, communicated to, and validated by peers in academe and the community.¹⁸ Community-engaged research and creative activity produces products informed by (multi)disciplinary knowledge, including, but not limited to publications, exhibitions, and programs¹⁹ that simultaneously meets campus mission and goals as well as addresses issues of societal concern. It is research or creative activity that involves systematic inquiry, produces results that are publicly observable, allows for critique, and is available for others to use and develop.²⁰ Community-engaged research and creative activity demonstrate methodological rigor through the use of methods that are appropriate to the goals, questions, and context of the work.²¹ Community-engaged research and creative activity is undertaken in collaboration with community partners who help set research questions, determine methodology, join in creating research projects, and/or engage in other activities that bridge academic and community contexts. Definitions of *community engagement*, *reciprocity*, and *community* are provided in the section above [see section on *Community Engagement*].

¹⁴ Products of community-engaged scholarship are listed in the UNCG University-wide Promotion and Tenure Guidelines, in Sections II.A.1.e; II.B.1.c; and, II.c.1.d.

¹⁵ Colbeck, C. & Wharton Michael, P. (2006). The public scholarship: Reintegrating Boyer's four domains. *Special Issue: Analyzing Faculty Work and Rewards: Using Boyer's Four Domains of Scholarship. New Directions for Institutional Research*, 129, 7-19.

¹⁶ Colbeck, C. (2004). Integration: Evaluating Faculty Work as a Whole. *New Directions for Institutional Research*, 114, 43-52.

¹⁷ Colbeck, C. (1998). Merging in a seamless blend: How faculty integrate teaching and research. *Journal of Higher Education*, 69(6), 647-671, as cited in Colbeck, C. (2004). Integration: Evaluating Faculty Work as a Whole. *New Directions for Institutional Research*, 114, 43-52.

¹⁸ Adapted from NCSU [Scholarship of Engagement Task Force Report](http://www.ncsu.edu/extension/documents/SET2010.pdf), 2010. Retrieved on February 26, 2011 from <http://www.ncsu.edu/extension/documents/SET2010.pdf>.

¹⁹ Publications, exhibitions, and programs listed in UNCG P&T Guidelines, Section II.B.1.c

²⁰ Colbeck, C., & Michael, P. (2006).

²¹ Jordan, C. M., et al. (2009). The Community-Engaged Scholarship Review Promotion and Tenure Package: A Guide for Faculty and Committee Members. *Metropolitan Universities Journal*, 20(2).

Community-engaged Teaching

Community-engaged teaching describes those activities that 1) honor principles of community engagement (reciprocal partnerships, public purpose), and 2) provide opportunities for students (both enrolled and not enrolled at UNCG) to collaborate with faculty and community members for the dual—and integrated—purposes of learning and service.²² Community-engaged teaching may be enacted through a variety of practices, including, but not limited to: service-learning experiences, on-site courses, clinical experiences, professional internships, community-based research or creative activities, collaborative programs, study-abroad courses and experiences, international instruction, and distance education courses²³--when these practices involve reciprocal partnerships with community members, groups, or organizations. Community-engaged teaching may also be enacted in collaboration with community partners for instruction to non-UNCG students (“instruction to communities and other constituencies”²⁴). Community-engaged teaching activities enhance the education of the students (whether enrolled at UNCG, or not) as well as the capacity of community members, groups, organizations, or the public more generally to address issues of societal concern. High quality community-engaged teaching is undertaken in collaboration with community partners who inform students’ public-serving projects to 1) help students make connections between their academic learning objectives and issues of societal concern; 2) “foster intellectual inquiry to prepare students for meaningful lives and engaged citizenship;”²⁵ 3) ensure the service addresses issues of societal concern; and 4) build capacity of students and community members, groups, and organizations to affect positive change. Definitions of *community engagement*, *reciprocity*, and *community* are provided in the section above [see section on *Community Engagement*].

--- ---

²² Saltmarsh, J. (2010). Changing pedagogies. In H. Fitzgerald, C. Burack, & S. Seifer. (Eds.) *Handbook of Engaged Scholarship: Contemporary Landscapes, Future Directions. Vol. 1: Institutional Change*. East Lansing, MI: Michigan State University Press.

²³ UNCG University-wide Promotions and Tenure Guidelines (2010). Section II.A.1.e

²⁴ UNCG University-wide Promotions and Tenure Guidelines (2010). Section II.A.1.e

²⁵ UNCG Vision and Mission Statement, Strategic Plan, 2009-2014. Retrieved on February 17, 2011 from http://uncgtomorrow.uncg.edu/plan/UNCG_StrategicPlan_2009-2014.pdf.

Community-engaged Service

Community-engaged service describes those activities that 1) honor principles of community engagement (reciprocal partnerships, public purpose), and 2) “enable the University to carry out its mission, contribute to the function and effectiveness of the faculty member’s profession and discipline, and reach out to external communities and constituencies, such as government agencies, business, and the arts.”²⁶ Faculty who use their academic knowledge, skills, methods, and paradigms to address practical affairs and problem-solving in the context of collaboration and reciprocity build their own capacity, as well as the capacity of the academy and community members, groups, and organizations to understand and collaboratively address issues of public concern. Faculty may provide community-engaged service in a variety of ways, including, but not limited to, collaborating with schools, organizations, businesses, advocacy groups, community groups, and civic and public agencies to develop policies, programs, grants, curricula, or understanding; developing and participating in partnerships between academic programs and external agencies, such as for the purposes of internships and service-learning courses; or providing leadership in or making significant contributions to economic and community development activities.²⁷

As noted in the definition of *community engagement* (see above), it is important to distinguish between activities that occur in the community or which provide service to communities through a one-way approach, and those that follow a collaborative approach with community members, groups or organizations to build capacity for positive societal change. While *community service* describes activities that are provided *to*, intended *for*, or done *in* communities, community-engaged service describes activities that are undertaken *with* community members in a context of reciprocal partnership. Again, rather than activity or place, the key distinction between community engagement and community service can be determined by the processes and purposes that each emphasizes.²⁸ The University values many forms of service; clarity between the various types allows for greater recognition of the duration of the commitment, the resources needed, the processes followed, and outcomes expected. Definitions of *community engagement*, *reciprocity*, and *community* are provided in the section above [see section on *Community Engagement*].

--- ---

Looking for Additional Literature, Models, and Practices?

Find additional resources on how to define and evaluate community-engaged scholarship within a variety of disciplines at: <http://olsl.uncg.edu/cbr/promotionandtenure/>

Would you like further in-person assistance?

Contact Emily Janke (Special Assistant for Community Engagement, ORED) at emjanke@uncg.edu,
or

Patrick Lee Lucas (2010-2011 Service-Learning Faculty Fellow, OLSL, and Associate Professor, Interior Architecture) at plucas@uncg.edu

²⁶ *UNCG Promotion and Tenure Guidelines*, Section II.C.1

²⁷ *UNCG Promotion and Tenure Guidelines*, Section II.C.1.d.

²⁸ Saltmarsh, J., Hartley, M., & Clayton, P. (2009).

Current Terms and Definitions of Community Engagement in the UNCG University-wide Promotion and Tenure Guidelines

UNCG defines Scholarship as:²⁹

“The promotion and tenure guidelines of the University rest on a definition of scholarship that can be applied to all aspects of University work:

“Scholarship is characterized by creative intellectual work based on a high level of professional expertise, the significance of which can be validated by peers and which enhances the fulfillment of the mission of the University. **Scholarship is not considered to be synonymous with research**, but can be demonstrated in activities in teaching, research and creative activity, service, and directed professional activity” (listed in UNCG Guidelines, Section I.A, *emphasis added*).

“Scholarship may be conducted by a variety of methods, across a variety of contexts, and in pursuit of a variety of purposes. Such scholarship can enhance or revise disciplinary knowledge; have an impact on various populations or organizations; or offer new theoretical insights. Because of the breadth of scholarly activity and its conduct, the path of any scholarly agenda will vary according to the nature of its questions and the means of their pursuit” (listed in UNCG Guidelines, Section II.C.4).

UNCG describes Community-engaged activities as:³⁰

Community-Engaged Teaching [Section II.A.1.e]

- Developing and delivering community-based instruction, such as service-learning experiences, on-site courses, clinical experiences, professional internships, and collaborative programs
- Developing and delivering off-campus teaching activities such as study-abroad courses and experiences, international instruction, and distance education courses
- Developing and delivering instruction to communities and other constituencies

Community-Engaged Research and Creative Activities [Section II.B.1.c]

- Writing papers for refereed journals and conference proceedings
- Creating exhibits in educational and cultural institutions
- Disseminating community-engaged research through public programs and events
- Conducting and disseminating directed or contracted research
- Conducting and reporting program evaluation research or public policy analyses for other institutions and agencies
- Developing innovation solutions that address social, economic, or environmental challenges (e.g., inventions, patents, products, services, clinical procedures and practices)

Community Engagement (Service)[Section II.C.1.d]

- Consulting and providing technical assistance and/or services to public and private organizations
- Writing position papers for the general public
- Collaborating with schools, businesses, advocacy groups, community groups, and civic agencies to develop policies
- Providing leadership in or making significant contribution to economic and community development activities

²⁹ Taken directly from the *University-Wide Evaluation Guidelines for Promotions and Tenure (amended by the General Faculty Nov. 18, 2009)*. This document is available on the website of the Office of the Provost <http://provost.uncg.edu/documents/personnel/evaluationPT.pdf>

³⁰ Taken directly from the *University-Wide Evaluation Guidelines for Promotions and Tenure*.